1. Competition Tribunal form CT6; and

IN THE COMPETITION TRIBUNAL OF SOUTH AFRICA

(HELD AT PRETORIA)

Respondent
Applicant
CC CASE NUMBER: 2020JUN0021
CT CASE NUMBER: CR142OCT22

("The Respondent")	
Dated at PRETORIA on this the 7 th day of Jun	e 2024
	COMPETITION COMMISSION
	Applicant
	77 Meintjies Street
	Sunnyside
	Pretoria
	Tel: 012 394 3527
	Ref: Bakhe Majenge/ Maya Swart/
	Simphiwe Gumede
	Email:BakheM@compcom.co.za/ MayaS@compcom.co.za/ Simphiweg@compcom.co.za

2. Settlement Agreement between the Competition Commission and Vita Gas (Pty) Ltd

TO: THE REGISTRAR

The Registrar of the Competition Tribunal

Block C DTI Campus

Mulayo Building

Meintjes Street

Sunnyside, Pretoria

Tel: (012) 394 3468

Fax: (012) 394 4468

Email: Registry@comptrib.co.za / tebogom@comptrib.co.za/

MatshidisoT@comptrib.co.za

AND TO: THE RESPONDENTS

c/o Bowmans Gilfillan

11 Alice Lane,

Sandton, Johannesburg

P O Box 785812, Sandton, 2146, South Africa

Ref: T Dini / A Gloor

Tel: 083 288 0348

Per email: tamara.dini@bowmanslaw.com /

alexander.gloor@bowmanslaw.com



By Themba Chauke at 11:20 am, Jun 11, 2024

SOUTH AFRICA

Form CT 6

About this Form

This Form is issued in terms of the Competition Tribunal Rules.

Please indicate in the space provided the nature of your motion, including specific reference to the relevant section of the Act or Tribunal Rules.

If this Notice of Motion concerns a matter being brought in terms of Division E of Part 4 of the Competition Tribunal Rules, it must comply with the requirements of Competition Tribunal Rule 42(3).

Notice of Motion

Date:	File #	
To: The regis	strar of the Competition Tribun	al
	the matter between:	(A 1;)
Take notice intends to ap	e that the ply to the Tribunal for the follo	wing order:
Name and 1	Title of person authorised to	sign:
Authorised	Signature: Date	: :
For Office Use Only:	Tribunal file number:	Date filed:

Contacting the Tribunal

The Competition Tribunal Private Bag X24 Sunnyside 0132

Republic of South Africa tel: 27 12 394 3300 e-mail: ctsa@comptrib.co.za

RECEIVED

By Themba Chauke at 11:20 am, Jun 11, 2024

IN THE COMPETITION TRIBUNAL OF SOUTH AFRICA (HELD AT PRETORIA)

CT CASE NUMBER: CR142Oct22

CC CASE NUMBER: 2020JUN0021

In the matter between:

THE COMPETITION COMMISSION OF SOUTH AFRICA

Applicant

And

VITA GAS (PTY) LTD

Respondent

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT IN TERMS OF SECTION 49D AS READ WITH SECTIONS 58(1)(a)(lii) AND 58(1)(b) OF THE COMPETITION ACT, 89 OF 1998, AS AMENDED, BETWEEN THE COMPETITION COMMISSION AND VITA GAS IN RESPECT OF ALLEGED CONTRAVENTIONS OF SECTION 8(1)(d)(i), ALTERNATIVELY SECTION 8(1)(c), OF THE COMPETITION ACT, 1998, AS AMENDED.



- 1.4. "Complaint" means the complaint submitted by Sunrise Energy to the Commission in terms of section 49B(2)(b) of the Act under case number 2020Jun0021;
- 1.5. "Complaint Referral" means the application filed with the Tribunal, by the Commission, in terms of section 50(2)(a) of the Act read with rule 14(1)(a) of the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings in the Tribunal under case number: CR142Oct22;
- 1.6. "LPG" means Liquid Petroleum Gas:
- 1.7. "LPG Terminal" means the import and storage facility located in the Port of Saldanha Bay in the Western Cape Province, owned and operated by Sunrise Energy;
- 1.8. "Respondent" means Vita Gas Proprietary Limited;
- 1.9. "Settlement Agreement" means this agreement duly signed and concluded between the Commission and Vita Gas;
- 1.10. "Sunrise Energy" means Sunrise Energy Proprietary Limited, a company incorporated under the company laws of South Africa, with its principal place of business at Off MR559, Industrial Area, Saldanha, 7395, Western Cape;

- 2.3. Sunrise specifically alleged that clause 12.2.3 of the Throughput Agreement granted Vita Gas rights to use 5500 MT of the LPG Terminal, while it restricted third parties or LPG aggregators wishing to use the LPG Terminal to only use 1100 MT capacity. It further alleged that even if Vita Gas had left one or more bullets empty, the maximum of 1100 MT assigned to the incoming customer (LPG aggregators) was small and uneconomical to import. According to Sunrise, this restriction effectively insulated Vita Gas from competing with potential importers. Sunrise alleged that these provisions contravened, either collectively or cumulatively, section 5(1), section 8(b), section 8(c) and section 8(d)(i) of the Act.
- 2.4. Vita Gas made submissions to the Commission in which it addressed the 'take or pay' nature of the Throughput Agreement and denied that the provisions of the Throughput Agreement contravened the Act. Vita Gas also asserted that the Throughput Agreement had pro-competitive benefits.
- 2.5. The investigation was extended to 31 October 2022 by agreement with Sunrise Energy.
- 2.6. The Commission found that the Throughput Agreement had, inter alia, the following anti-competitive terms and features:
 - 2.6.1. In terms of the Throughput Agreement, Vita Gas was entitled to use all five bullets at the LPG Terminal with a storage capacity of 5500 MT,



Sunrise Energy only afforded third party customers or LPG Aggregators a ten-day dwell time which further contributed to the capacity available to third party LPG importers or LPG Aggregators being meaningless and insufficient.

- 2.6.4. The duration of the Throughput Agreement was for a period of five years, but Sunrise Energy granted to Vita Gas the right to extend the duration on the same terms and conditions for up to a maximum of three additional periods, each of 5 (five) calendar years. The maximum duration of the agreement was accordingly 20 years and six months⁴.
- 2.7. This near-exclusive Throughput Agreement covered almost all of the available LPG import terminal services and facilities in the Western Cape from March 2018 until the date of the Complaint referral, 28 October 2022, as Sunrise Energy was the principal LPG terminal operator in the Western Cape at the time. The Commission found that the remaining throughput capacity at the LPG Terminal which was available to third parties or LPG Aggregators was rendered meaningless by the terms of the Throughput Agreement.
- 2.8. The Commission considered that the effect of the Throughput Agreement was that at any given point in time, competitors (including potential competitors) of Vita Gas were unable to import LPG through the LPG Terminal in quantities and at prices that would afford them sufficient scale to enter into, participate in,

RIMPO

⁴ See clause 2 read with clauses 4.

3. TERMINATION OF LPG HANDLING AND THROUGHPUT AGREEMENT

3.1. On 19 June 2023, Vita Gas informed the Commission that it had terminated the Throughput Agreement concluded with Sunrise Energy in respect of the LPG Terminal with effect from 15 June 2023.

4. ADMISSION

4.1. Vita Gas does not admit that it contravened sections 8(d)(i) and 8(1)(d)(i), alternatively 8(c) and 8(1)(c) of the Act.

5. FUTURE CONDUCT

- 5.1. Vita Gas agrees to:
 - 5.1.1. prepare and circulate a statement summarizing the contents of this Settlement Agreement to all relevant employees, managers, and directors within fourteen (14) days of the date of confirmation of this Settlement Agreement as an order of the Tribunal;
 - 5.1.2. refrain from engaging in conduct in contravention of section 8(1)(d)(i) or 8(1)(c) of the Act; and



Dated and signed at Green Point	on the	23	_ day of	May	2024
For Vita Gas Proprietary Limited					
Name in Full: Richard Moorhouse					
Position: Managing Director	<u> </u>				
Dated and signed at PRETORIA	on the_	06	day of	JUN	E 2024
For the Competition Commission Doris Ishepe					
Commissioner					

A . . .